Perception of the Effects of Bureaucratic Corruption on the Provision of Healthcare Facilities in Selected Local Government Areas of Borno State, Nigeria

Fatima Shehu Liberty
Department of Political Science, Faculty of Management Sciences, University of Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria

ABSTRACT: The public institutionalism perspective derives its interest from the fact that all public enterprises are established for the people, thus, what officials do should be a reflection of their characteristics. In fact, the veil of secrecy in the public service has to be removed. The interest-maximizing perspective (a market-centred approach) accuses officials of converting public resources into goods needed to initiate and maintain corrupt relations while the political economy perspective highlights that the state is the mechanism to accumulate wealth. This research examined the perception of the effects of bureaucratic corruption on the provision of healthcare facilities in selected local government areas of Borno state, Nigeria. The study used a total of three hundred and fifty (350) questionnaires was administered on the respondents (staff), of the total questionnaires administered two hundred and twenty five (225) were returned valid, while fifteen (15) were invalidated. The study found out that healthcare facilities are not accessible and that there are no enough drugs, but immunization vaccine are administered regularly. The study recommended that there should be proper monitoring of the Local Government to ensure that they focus on provision of basic needs, social amenities and infrastructure to the people at the grassroots as required by them and that stringent measures should be put in place to check, control and curb with bureaucratic corruption which has eaten so deep and almost destroy the system.

Keywords: Bureaucratic corruption, Healthcare, public services, local government administration

I. INTRODUCTION

Three tiers of government exist in Nigeria, federal, state, and the local government. The federal government is charged with the responsibility of handling federal projects in their capital and recurrent expenditure nature, the state as second tier of government handles state issues ranging from capital to recurrent projects. The local government system being the third tier of government is charged with the responsibility of handling projects which have a direct influence on the masses at the grassroots level. They are the most in contact with the people at the rural areas which contained the lion share of the population. They are mostly characterized by unemployment, poverty, homelessness, hunger, poor road network or health care facilities in their community. The political actors influence the activities of the local government system adversely and these have a great impact on the performance in terms of service delivery.

The healthcare system at the local government level is very poor, some areas have dispensaries and clinics but there are always no drugs and qualified doctors and nurses. Some have no health care facility at all. The masses are helpless and are exposed to untimely death. The number of school is always insufficient in most of the rural areas. And where there is little presence of schools, the number of pupils enrolled into the school is not adequate because they did not believe in continuity. There are times when roof of classrooms were blown off by heavy wind, the teachers have to teach in the open and sometimes under the tree (where there are trees).

Budgets are always sufficient on paper documentation but not in conformity with physical or practical evidence on ground. There is hardly a time when a budget is implemented at the right time, right cost and at the right and appropriate schedule. For instance, money budgeted for health sector wrongly channelled to a different ministry such as commerce which is not a priority ministry or money budgeted for schools are deliberately diverted to unnecessary workshop and other fictitious claims from the politicians and other collaborators. It is against these background that the study was assessed the effect of bureaucratic corruption on service delivery in local government areas in Borno State, Nigeria.

Statement of the Problem

There has been wide condemnation of corruption and corrupt activities by all and sundry in almost all the spheres of the local government system in Nigeria due to the horrific dimension it assumes in recent times, hence the need for a concise public discourse on the subject. Bureaucratic corruption thrives in an environment where ethical norms and values of a group are violated, prevalence can safely be used as a measure of the extent
to which ethical values in the local governments have been eroded. Bureaucratic corruption is prevalent in local governments in Nigeria due to its structure and interference by the state government and because most of local government officials/officers are imposed by their political masters to satisfy their personal and political agenda. Despite some control measures put in place in local government system to checkmate these sharp practices, bureaucratic corruption seems to be thriving freely in the local government system in Borno state. Although several studies have been conducted as regard the issue, Werlin, (1973), Lawal and Tobi, (2006) and Nwozo, (2010), none address effects of bureaucratic corruption on the provision of healthcare facilities in Borno state, Nigeria, hence the need for this study.

Objectives of the Study
The main objective of the study is to examine people’s perception on effects of bureaucratic corruption on the provision of healthcare facilities in selected local government areas of Borno state, Nigeria.

Research Hypothesis

H0: Bureaucratic corruption does not significantly affect the provision of healthcare facilities in local government areas of Borno state, Nigeria.

II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Concept of Corruption
Corruption is a social problem that has interested many scholars. Gbenga (2008); asserts that corruption in Africa is a problem of routine deviation from established standards and norms by public officials and parties with whom they interact. Also bureaucratic corruption, is not an exclusive domain of black Africa (Braibanti, 1962), it is however, one of the enduring peculiarities of the sub-continent that has perennially subdued economic development He also identified the types of corruption in Africa as bribery, private gain, and other benefits to non-existent workers and pensioners (called ghost workers). The dishonest and illegal behaviour exhibited especially by people in authority for their personal gain is corruption. According to the ICPC Act (section 2), corruption includes vices like bribery, fraud, and other related offences. Corruption is the abuse or misuse of power or position of trust for personal or group benefit (monetary or otherwise).

Concept of Bureaucratic Corruption
Cuadrado and Arce (2005) stated that bureaucratic corruption must be considered as a complex phenomenon because of the number and heterogeneity of its elements that, when they meet, form non-trivial links that in turn pave the way to creative changes following the environment’s evolution. Given its complex nature, corruption can be explained through many aspects of complexity thinking.

Corruption also raises the operating cost of infrastructure services, and reduces the quality of services and access to them, especially for the poor (Transparency International, 2005). Marx (in Gould, 1980) stresses that “accumulation of wealth at one pole is at the same time accumulation of misery, agony of toil, slavery, ignorance, brutality, mental degradation at the opposite pole”, while Anger (2004) summarizes the consequences by quoting the UN Secretary General, Kofi Annan (2003), saying:

The poor record of punishing corruption both by those in power and the judicial results in many other people emulating corrupt activities and the continued uncertainty about jobs and anxiety in many people about their well-being contribute immensely to the present escalation of corruption in public offices. Shana (2006); notes that public enterprise accounting and professionalism are subordinate to party politics. It is inevitable that immoral, criminal and corrupt activities that serve political advantage are given immunity and impunity which result in corruption being justified as a political strategy and patronage for political protection (Shana 2006).

Shana (2006) further argues that scarcity of resources, unlimited political power and patronage in public enterprises is a recipe for corruption. Most Chief Executive Officers of public enterprises are appointed to such posts basing on political affiliation that result in faulty management. Van der Waldt and Helmbold (1995) highlight that there are different opinions about the causes of and reasons for corruption including unethical behaviour by individuals or institutions in general. Some unethical behaviour linked to corruption is deficient controls and accountability, inadequate procedures, and deficient management systems.

Manifestation of Bureaucratic Corruption in Local Government Administration

Bauer and Vanwyk (1999) highlight five forms of how bureaucratic corruption manifest itself in public enterprises which are:

I. Embezzlement - which involves theft of resources by officers entrusted with authority and control of such resources,

II. Fraud - which involves actions or behaviours by public officers, other persons or entities that fool others into providing a benefit that would not normally accrue to the officer, other persons or entity,

III. Extortion -This is the coercing of a person or entity to provide a benefit to a public official, another person or entity in exchange for acting in a particular manner,

IV. Abuse of power - which is the abuse of authority to improperly benefit another or entity, for example, during a tender process but before actual selection of a successful contractor, the officers in charge express their wish to see the contract awarded to a specific person or bidder, and,
V. Conflict of interest - which involves public officers acting or failing to act on a matter where officials have interest or other persons or entities that stand in a relationship with officials who have interests and insider trading/abuse of privileged information. This involves the use of privileged information and knowledge that officials possess as a result of his/her office to provide unfair advantage to another person or entity to obtain a benefit or to accrue a benefit to himself/herself are other forms of manifestation of corruption (Shana, 2006).

Empirical Studies
According to Dike (2007), corruption is the violation of established rules for self-gains. It is the effort to secure wealth or power through illegitimate means at the public expense. Corruption in most state public offices in the Nigeria manifest itself in the form of bribery, embezzlement, fraud, extortion, abuse of power, conflict of interest, favouritism, ghosting, nepotism and graft (Aina 2006). Alata (1991) defines corruption as the abuse of trust in the interest of private gains and divides it into seven types which are:

I. Autogenic corruption: which is self-generating and typically involves only the perpetrator,

II. Defensive corruption: which is corruption that involves situations where a person needing a critical service is compelled to bribe in order to prevent unpleasant results being inflated on one’s interest.

III. Injunctive corruption: is corruption that entails the offering of goods or services without a direct link to any particular favour at the time but in anticipation of future situations when the favour may be required

IV. Extortive corruption: is a corruption that entails the behaviour of a person demanding compensation in exchange for service,

V. Nepotistic corruption: being corruption that refers to the preferential treatment of or unjustified appointment of friends or relations to public office in violation of the accepted guidelines,

VI. Supportive corruption: is that corruption which usually does not involve money or immediate gains but involves actions taken to protect or strengthen the existing corruption, and,

VII. Transactive corruption: is that corruption which refers to situations where the two parties are mutual and willing participants in the corrupt practice to the advantage of both parties.

Nigeria citizens and those who receive services from state public offices rightfully expect public offices, regardless of type, to act reasonably and in accordance with global acceptable corporate governance best practices and cultural backgrounds (Chikura, 2000). It is the thinking of those served by state public offices at all levels of society that such institutions, as public enterprising organs of the society, will therefore be responsible to the general public and will conform to the standard expected of them in executing their mandate (Chikura, 2004).

Theoretical Framework - The Efficiency Theory
Efficiency is defined as the measure of effectiveness that produces the minimum waste of time, effort and skill. It is a term that has recently come to the forefront of scientific world. As the world struggles to accommodate enormous growth in population and to manage the distribution of resources, the effort to make things more efficient has become increasingly more relevant. If we are truly in pursuit of maximum efficiency, we need to look at how efficient we are as a social system.

In relation to the theory of efficiency, the effect of bureaucratic corruption on service efficiency in the local government administration cannot be over emphasized. The bureaucrats (local government officials) may be cumbered by needs for survival (physiological needs) and ignore efficiency of services, social, crime, economic and political volatility that makes them to only prepare for now and future survival-not efficiency. Therefore, they tend to be driven by their selfish appetites desires and passions. They are carried away in cutthroat competition, diffidence and the love of glory. Their interest in rendering service is “who benefits” only favourable information is been paid attention to by them, whereas unfavourable or unfamiliar information is ignored or frustrated. Therefore, this study evaluates the effect of bureaucratic corruption on efficiency of service in local government administration, with the Efficiency Theory as the theoretical framework.

III. METHODOLOGY
This study was conducted in North Eastern Borno State, Nigeria. The assessed the perception of people on the effect of bureaucratic corruption on healthcare service delivery. The study has a population of twenty seven (27) local government areas and a sampling frame of the entire local government staff: senior and junior staff inclusive as well as selected members of the communities. Primary data were explored sourced through the use of a structured questionnaire administered on 250 sampled staff of the selected Local Government Areas and community members. Stratified sampling was used in selecting the staff: the local government served as the primary unit, while the staff are the secondary units. The data collected were organized and then presented in a tabular form after which simple percentage, chi-square and one-way Analysis of Variance (ONE-WAY ANOVA) was used to test the relevant hypotheses postulated for the purpose of the study.
IV. DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSES

Table 1: Forms of Bureaucratic Corruption

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contract inflation</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embezzlement</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghost workers</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversion of funds</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Un-budgetary expenditure</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: field survey, 2019

Table 1 indicates that majority of respondents believe embezzlement and diversion of funds are the forms of bureaucratic corruptions with the most effect on quality of service delivery in Local Government Areas in Borno state; these represent 35 and 38 percent respectively. Other forms include contract inflation 11%, ghost worker 8%, non-budgetary expenditure 5% and those who mention other forms like lack of due process in award of contract, award of contract to fake companies and poor budget implementation, represent only 3%.

Table 2: Primary Service Delivery in the Local Governments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Healthcare</th>
<th>Budget Implementation</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freq %</td>
<td>Freq %</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very efficient</td>
<td>25 (11%)</td>
<td>11 (4%)</td>
<td>225 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficient</td>
<td>43 (19%)</td>
<td>45 (20%)</td>
<td>225 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inefficient</td>
<td>157 (70%)</td>
<td>75 (35%)</td>
<td>225 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: field survey, 2019

Table 2 shows that 11% of the respondents rated the performance of Primary Health Care department as very efficient, 19% said efficient, while 70% said not efficient. This is obvious that majority of the respondents are of opinion that the performance of the entire department is not efficient except that of Works department with relatively better rating. That 5% of the respondents are of the opinion that Primary Health Care implement their budget to the/a very great/large extent, 20% said to a large extent, while 75% said not at all. It is obvious that majority of the respondents are of the opinion that departments in Local government Administration do not implement their budgets and the implication is that service delivery is compromised.

Table 3: The Performance of Primary Health Care Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>AG</th>
<th>UD</th>
<th>DA</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare centres are available and accessible</td>
<td>12 (5%)</td>
<td>24 (11%)</td>
<td>10 (4%)</td>
<td>48 (21%)</td>
<td>130 (58%)</td>
<td>225 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are always enough drugs in our community</td>
<td>14 (6%)</td>
<td>96 (43%)</td>
<td>13 (6%)</td>
<td>29 (13%)</td>
<td>14 (6%)</td>
<td>225 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immunization vaccines are administered regularly on routine basis</td>
<td>72 (32%)</td>
<td>96 (43%)</td>
<td>13 (6%)</td>
<td>29 (13%)</td>
<td>91 (40%)</td>
<td>225 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No much outbreak of diseases in our community</td>
<td>24 (11%)</td>
<td>10 (4%)</td>
<td>18 (8%)</td>
<td>82 (36%)</td>
<td>91 (40%)</td>
<td>225 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: field survey, 2019

Table 3 shows that 58% of the respondent strongly disagreed that health care centres are available and accessible for the communities, the 21% disagreed 4% are undecided 10% agreed while 5% strongly agreed. 60% of the respondent strongly disagreed that there are always drugs enough in the community 27% disagreed 4% are undecided 6% agreed while 3% strongly agreed. 32% the respondent agreed that immunization vaccine are administered regularly, 43% agrees 6% are undecided 13% disagreed while 14% strongly disagreed. 40% of the respondent strongly disagreed that there is no break of diseases in the community, 36% disagreed 4% agreed while 11% strongly disagreed. This is very obvious that majority of the respondent are of the opinion healthcare centres are not available and accessible, there are no enough drugs is the community, immunization are administered on regular bases and that there is outbreak of diseases in the community.

Summary

It was observed from the study that majority of the respondents are employees of local government, as other member of the local governments studied engage in various other profession like trading and farming. Majority of respondents are also educated (have formal education). On the issue of service delivery according to
Bureaucratic corruption is a complex phenomenon that is fractal, ranging from manifestation at lower levels in actions such as small gifts for a secretary to have him/her arrange an appointment with the boss, to higher-level influence in legislative processes for private ends, meaning corruption is exhibited at all levels in varying degree. Ethics is a system or set of moral principles and rules of conduct organized in respect to a particular group or culture; it denotes among other things trust, respect, responsibility, accountability, fairness, empathy/honesty, good and bad etc.

However, this has since been violated in almost all disciplines and institutions. Therefore, having carefully and exhaustively assessed the issue under study; the researcher does conclude that bureaucratic corruption has impacted negatively on the adequacy and availability of service delivery on the local government administration in Borno state, especially in Primary Health Care.

**Recommendations**

In view of the findings and conclusion reached at the end of the study, the following recommendations are made:

I. There should be proper monitoring of the Local Government to ensure that they focus on provision of basic needs, social amenities and infrastructure to the people at the grassroots as required by them.

II. Stringent measures should be put in place to check, control and curb bureaucratic corruption which has eaten so deep and almost destroy the system.

III. Employees of local government should be encouraged to maintain ethics of work within budgets, and a mechanism should be developed to punish any individual or group of individuals that violate laid down rules and regulations in the discharge of the official duties in the administration of their respective local government.

IV. A measurable standard should be established to ensure that projects and services are delivered according to set standard. In this regards consistent monitoring and evaluation should be practiced to ensure that any deviation at any stage of implementation should be corrected promptly.

**VI. REFERENCES**